MINUTES OF THE
MARICOPA ASSOCIATION OF GOVERNMENTS
MAG REGIONAL COUNCIL EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE
October 17, 2016
MAG Offices, Ironwood Room
302 N. 1ˢᵗ Avenue, Phoenix, Arizona

<u>MEMBERS ATTENDING</u>

Mayor Greg Stanton, Phoenix, Chair   *Mayor Mark Mitchell, Tempe
Mayor Jackie Meck, Buckeye, Vice Chair   Mayor Lana Mook, El Mirage
Mayor Gail Barney, Queen Creek   Mayor Jerry Weiers, Glendale
#Mayor W.J. "Jim" Lane, Scottsdale

* Not present
# Participated by video or telephone conference call

1.   <u>Call to Order</u>

     The Executive Committee meeting was called to order by Chair Stanton at 12:10 p.m. Mayor
     Lane participated by teleconference.

2.   <u>Call to the Audience</u>

     Chair Stanton stated according to the MAG public comment process, members of the
     audience who wish to speak are requested to fill out the public comment cards. He stated that
     there is a three-minute time limit. Public comment is provided at the beginning of the
     meeting for items that are not on the agenda that are within the jurisdiction of MAG, or non-
     action agenda items that are on the agenda for discussion or information only. Chair Stanton
     noted no public comment cards had been received.

3.   <u>Approval of Executive Committee Consent Agenda</u>

     Chair Stanton noted prior to action on the consent agenda, members of the audience are
     provided an opportunity to comment on consent items that are being presented for action.
     Following the comment period, committee members may request that an item be removed
     from the consent agenda.

     Chair Stanton requested a motion to approve the consent agenda. Mayor Barney moved to
     approve consent items 3A through 3E. Mayor Lane seconded the motion and the motion
     carried unanimously.

3A.   <u>Approval of the September 19, 2016 Executive Committee Meeting Minutes</u>

The Regional Council Executive Committee, by consent, approved the September 19, 2016 Executive Committee meeting minutes.

3B.   Consultant Selection for the MAG Regional Commuter Rail System Study Update

The Regional Council Executive Committee, by consent, approved the selection of the firm AECOM to conduct an update to the 2010 MAG Commuter Rail System Study for an amount not to exceed $150,000.

The Fiscal Year (FY) 2017 MAG Unified Planning Work Program and Annual Budget, approved by the MAG Regional Council in May 2016, includes $150,000 for an update to the 2010 MAG Commuter Rail System Study. The scope of work and purpose of this 12-month study is to update the 2010 data and study governance options and indemnity/liability issues related to passenger rail implementation. A Request for Proposals was issued on July 12, 2016. Two proposals were received and both firms were interviewed. On September 26, 2016, the evaluation team recommended to MAG the selection of the firm AECOM to conduct the study. This item was on the October 5, 2016 Management Committee agenda for recommended approval.

3C.   Approval to Enter into an Agreement with Opportunities for Youth to Provide Custom Maps and Data Analysis and to Amendment the FY 2017 MAG Unified Planning Work Program and Annual Budget to Accept Funding

The Regional Council Executive Committee, by consent, approved entering into an agreement and to accept up to $10,000 from Opportunities for Youth for conducting custom mapping and analysis, and to approve the budget amendment to the FY 2017 MAG Unified Planning Work Program and Annual Budget to add this funding for an increase to the overall budget of $10,000.

MAG staff maintains a number of regional GIS data sets that are utilized to conduct analysis and mapping. MAG staff was approached by the Opportunities for Youth, that is housed by Maricopa County, to explore the possibility of providing assistance in developing custom GIS mapping and analysis supporting the Program. Working with the Opportunity for Youth team, MAG staff has developed a scope of work to support the project. The tasks include compiling and organizing data sets available to the Program through their partners, and creating a number of maps and analysis utilizing publicly available data sets. Staff is requesting approval to enter into an agreement with Opportunity for Youth for conducting custom mapping and analysis and to approve the budget amendment to the FY 2017 MAG Unified Planning Work Program and Annual Budget to add this funding for an increase to the overall budget of $10,000.

3D.   Approval to Enter into an Agreement with El Dorado Holdings, Inc. to Provide Custom Maps and Data Analysis and to Amendment the FY 2017 MAG Unified Planning Work Program and Annual Budget to Accept Funding

The Regional Council Executive Committee, by consent, approved entering into an agreement and to accept up to $2,000 from El Dorado Holdings, Inc., and to approve the budget amendment to the FY 2017 MAG Unified Planning Work Program and Annual Budget to add this funding for an increase to the overall budget of $2,000.

MAG staff was approached by El Dorado Holdings, Inc. to explore the possibility of providing assistance in developing custom GIS maps and analysis. Working with the El Dorado Holdings, Inc. team, MAG staff has developed a scope of work to support the project. The tasks include developing custom travel time contours to a site and conducting customized analysis and mapping based upon Census and other MAG data sets. Staff is requesting approval to enter into an agreement with El Dorado Holdings, Inc. and to amend the FY 2017 UPWP to accept up to $2,000 for conducting custom mapping and analysis, and to approve the budget amendment to the FY 2017 MAG Unified Planning Work Program and Annual Budget to add this funding for an increase to the overall budget of $2,000.

3E.   Appointment of MAG Technical Advisory Group Vice Chair

The Regional Council Executive Committee, by consent, approved the appointment of Mike Ciccarone from Fountain Hills as Vice Chair of the MAG Technical Advisory Group.

On August 21, 2013, the MAG Regional Council approved the updated MAG Committee Operating Policies and Procedures. The Policies and Procedures state that in the event of a vacancy in the Chair position, the Vice Chair becomes Chair for the unexpired term of the previous Chair, and a new Vice Chair is appointed by the Executive Committee to complete the remainder of the Vice Chair's term. The Chair of the MAG Technical Advisory Group, Debbie Cotton, has resigned from her position at the City of Phoenix and has relinquished her position as the MAG Technical Advisory Group Chair. According to the Policies and Procedures, Vice Chair Dan Cotterman, from the City of Goodyear, will ascend to the Chair position. Incoming Chair Cotterman will serve out the remainder of Chair Cotton's tenure, which is due to expire on December 31, 2017.

On September 29, 2016, MAG staff sent a notice to the MAG Management Committee, the MAG Technical Advisory Group, and the Intergovernmental Representatives to solicit letters of interest for the Vice Chair position of the MAG Technical Advisory Group.

4.   Request for Funding for the Regional ExporTech Program

Chair Stanton notified the committee that this item is on the agenda at his request. He said during his speech at the Regional Council annual meeting, one of the things he mentioned he wanted to accomplish during his time as Chairman was increase exports in the region to assist the economy. Chair Stanton noted that one of the best programs the region has in place is the Arizona Commerce Authority's (ACA) ExporTech Program. He said the City of Phoenix has taken advantage of the program and he would like to take the program region-wide through MAG.

Executive Director Dennis Smith said MAG has been working with the City of Phoenix and the ACA on this initiative. He noted the $12,500 staff is asking for today would be used to co-sponsor the program and augment the fees that it costs a business to register for the program. Mr. Smith said MAG plans to take the program region-wide and would look to have a balanced group from across the Valley participate.

City of Phoenix Economic Development Executive Officer Hank Marshall said ExporTech has been around since 2007, with approximately 163 programs in 33 states that have assisted approximately 900 companies. He noted roughly 30 businesses from the City of Phoenix have completed the program. Mr. Marshall said Phoenix is getting ready to conduct its third session of ExporTech this month, with eight companies participating. He told the committee that two graduates of the program have gone on to win the President's "E" Award for exports. Mr. Marshall said he would like to see the program extended to the broader region. He noted that the ACA and the City of Phoenix would assist in the recruitment of companies for the regional effort.

ACA's Vice President of International Trade Kevin O'Shea explained that ExporTech is a program delivered by the ACA through its RevAZ Revenue Manufacturing Extension Partnership Program. He said ExporTech is a nationally recognized program, proven to help small and mid-sized companies boost their sales revenues via exports. Mr. O'Shea said that the ACA has held six ExporTech programs since 2014, and is considered nationally to be a highly robust program. He noted the ACA has held programs in Tucson, Mesa, Phoenix, and Chandler.

Mr. O'Shea explained that ExporTech is a 60 day export boot camp where companies are exposed to a variety of export topics from logistics to legal issues. He said between sessions, participants work with a program-assigned export coach to conduct market research and refine their international strategies. Mr. O'Shea stated the companies interact with a variety of seasoned local exporters who work with the participating companies during the program and continue to offer assistance after the program is completed. He said that companies graduate with a wealth of export knowledge, expert contacts, and an export plan specific to their company product or service. Mr. O'Shea noted the participating companies are assigned an export coach to assist with putting a plan into action.

Mr. O'Shea said there are a wide variety of companies that participate in the program that range from having no export experience to being export savvy. He recognized Chair Stanton as a champion of export readiness in the collaboration between the ACA and the City of Phoenix.

Chair Stanton asked Mr. O'Shea what companies would get with the $12,500 from MAG. Mr. O'Shea explained the funds would be split up amongst eight companies, which comes out to about $1,500 per company. He said part of the money would offset registration costs to incentivize companies to participate, but more importantly, would provide them with go-to-market assistance. Mr. O'Shea noted the challenge is what happens after the program is

finished. He said with the combined financial assistance that MAG and ACA would bring to the table, the participating companies will be able to undertake go-to-market initiatives that are identified in their export plans.

Chair Stanton asked if anyone has tried to quantify what it would cost a company if they were to buy these services from a private entity. He said his impression is that it would cost tens of thousands of dollars for a company to buy these consulting services. Mr. O'Shea said he believes it would cost a company between $25,000 and $50,000 for these services outside of the ExporTech program.

Chair Stanton said the program currently lacks participation from cities in the West Valley, which is why he would like to take the program regional. He stated he wants to depoliticize the process and ensure there is regional representation for companies to participate in ExporTech, supported through MAG resources.

Mr. Smith said that MAG will be highly selective of the companies chosen to participate in the regional ExporTech program. He commented that he would rely on the expertise at the ACA and City of Phoenix to identify the companies that are ready for this next step.

Chair Stanton said that MAG needs to ensure there is geographical balance in the program as a requirement. Mr. Marshall said he plans to contact economic development groups in the West Valley and provide them with a profile of a company that would be an ideal candidate for recruitment to the program. He noted that to get eight viable companies to participate and be successful, officials will need to contact 40-50 companies. Mr. Marshall said it is hard to find companies willing to make the time commitment, staff commitment, and be willing to do the homework between sessions. He stated he intends to work closely with MAG to make the program a success.

Chair Stanton requested a motion to approve the funding to partner with ACA and co-sponsor a regional ExporTech program with the Arizona Commerce Authority RevAZ Manufacturing Extension Partnership program for an amount not to exceed $12,500. Mayor Meck made a motion to recommend approval and Mayor Barney seconded the motion. The motion carried unanimously.

5. <u>Report on the Discussions of Data Collection Efforts Related to the Greater Phoenix Chamber of Commerce Regional Business Retention and Expansion Efforts</u>

Chair Stanton said that it was his opinion that MAG is uniquely set up to be supportive of ExporTech and move forward with our companies based throughout the valley. He noted that MAG is uniquely positioned to help Greater Phoenix and others with data because it is something MAG is good at doing. Chair Stanton said MAG enhances other organizations, like the Greater Phoenix Chamber of Commerce, by providing them with data. He stated he believes this is an area where MAG can be very involved with economic development without replacing or duplicating the work that any other organization is doing.

Mr. Smith said this item was put on the agenda today at Mayor Lane's request at the September 19th committee meeting. He said there has been a lot of confusion surrounding the business retention and expansion (BRE) discussion taking place through the Greater Phoenix Chamber. Mr. Smith recalled that on June 7, 2016, at the Economic Development Committee (EDC) meeting, the Greater Phoenix Chamber brought in a team from Dayton, Ohio to discuss their BRE program model. He said that during that meeting, several EDC members pointed out that there are existing institutions in the Valley, such as GPEC, that deal with BRE and said they felt our region can work to fine tune its efforts without moving to a centralized model.

Mr. Smith said a few weeks after the EDC meeting, the Greater Phoenix Chamber called and asked to use one of MAG's meeting rooms to have further discussion of a regional BRE program. He noted the first meeting was held August 23, 2016, with various cities participating including Buckeye, Glendale, Surprise, Tempe, Phoenix and Peoria, as well as the ACA, Greater Phoenix Economic Council (GPEC), and Valley chambers. Mr. Smith stated the first meeting was a moderated discussion to find out what the cities were doing for BRE and what clusters they were focusing on.

Mr. Smith said when he was asked about what MAG's economic development focus was, he said it was the South Mountain Freeway. He stated the freeway is going to be pivotal for the City of Phoenix. Mr. Smith said he also mentioned that MAG is taking the data sets in the areas of transportation and socioeconomic issues and getting the data back out to the cities.

Mr. Smith said during the meeting, he mentioned that MAG wants to be known as an economic development organization. He mentioned in hindsight, he recognized that his statement caused a lot of concern and was the subject of discussion among certain groups. Mr. Smith stated MAG's data is useful for economic development. Mr. Smith explained that he had a discussion with the head of GPEC about what MAG is working on, and that there was no change in what it was already doing.

Mr. Smith said GPEC requested that MAG talk about its data at the next meeting of the group. He noted MAG staff presented a revised presentation previously given to GPEC staff. Mr. Smith said resources spent on this effort by MAG staff were minimal, with less than ten personnel hours spent.

Mr. Smith said all activities with the Greater Phoenix Chamber's BRE meetings have been put on hold until guidance is received from this committee. He explained he does not want people to think that MAG has gone around the Regional Council to work on a BRE model that is similar to the Dayton model. Mr. Smith said MAG is focusing on data that will make the region smarter.

Mayor Lane said that the only concern he brought up at the meeting last month was whether there had been any authorization by the MAG Regional Council to enter into an agreement with the Greater Phoenix Chamber either informally or formally. He noted this item is still

on today's agenda for information and discussion, and asked if there is a plan or if there would be an opportunity to have the Regional Council weigh in and say if they want to participate in this effort. Mayor Lane said he heard Mr. Smith's explanation and does not disagree, but his concern was whether or not MAG is embarking on something without a vote by Regional Council. He stated protocol should be followed to officially put this program in place and determine what expenditure of funds would be used. Mayor Lane said the committee just went through instances with MAGIC where MAG is selling data. He wondered if it is a different situation when we talk about the use of existing resources in this venture.

Chair Stanton said he assumes Mayor Lane is attempting to provide specific authorization by the Executive Committee and then by the Regional Council to get approval for a partnership with the Greater Phoenix Chamber and others relative to data sharing for economic development. Mr. Smith said he never saw this effort as being that formal. He explained that MAG works with a lot of organizations and provides them with data. Mr. Smith said, for example, that MAG takes information out of the trip reduction program, puts it into a format economic development staff can use, and then distributes it to members.

Chair Stanton said that Mayor Lane raised the issue of the MAGIC model. He stated the difference is that MAG is not gathering new information for the Greater Phoenix Chamber. Chair Stanton noted that this is existing information, whereas the MAGIC model is where MAG conducts specific studies done only because an outside entity is paying for those services.

Mr. Smith said that Chair Stanton is correct. He stated if an agency or business requests a large job or a lot of customized research from MAG, it is done through MAGIC. Mr. Smith said in most cases, MAG provides information to cities without a paid agreement.

Mayor Lane said he understands this is not a formal arrangement, with no contract or partnership established, but he said the Greater Phoenix Chamber, while regionally minded, is still in a competitive environment with other chambers and other cities. He stated if a city chooses not to participate with the Greater Phoenix Chamber BRE effort, its data, through MAG, could still be solicitited or given over to a chamber it may be in competition with.

Mayor Stanton said if the President and CEO of the Greater Phoenix Chamber Todd Sanders were at this meeting, he would remind the committee that his organization represents greater Phoenix and is meant to be a regional chamber of commerce, not specific to the City of Phoenix. He noted there are other chambers that work with different parts of the Valley, but said the Greater Phoenix Chamber is intended to be the chamber for all businesses in the Valley.

Mayor Lane said in this case, if you chose not to participate in this program and your data is used, you are automatically at a disadvantage, particularly if we are already working in the BRE space as individual cities or with GPEC. Mayor Lane said the Greater Phoenix Chamber says they are not in competition with GPEC, but said he has heard differently from other

sources.   He stated the easiest way to resolve this issue is to take it to the Regional Council and ask them to vote on it.

Mayor Mook said it is her understanding that any information MAG comes in contact with, participates in, pays for, or gets paid for, is information that all members can have access to. She noted that has been the case with information when the City of El Mirage has requested it. Mayor Mook said she does not see a problem with MAG sharing data with the Greater Phoenix Chamber or why this needs to be discussed. She stated that to support Mayor Lane, the committee could take a vote to the Regional Council.

Chair Stanton said he does not have a strong preference, but said the committee needs to figure out what it would be taking to Regional Council. He asked if it was the issue of working with Greater Phoenix Chamber in particular, or if it is a general question that if any local chamber of commerce went to MAG and asked them to provide them existing information, would Mr. Smith have the authority to provide it because its public data, or does MAG need a specific data policy. He explained that the City of Phoenix has adopted an open data policy that requires any data collected in the city, unless there are privacy or proprietary issues, to be made publicly available. Chair Stanton said the information is available not just to other government entities, but for citizens and even businesses, in particular those that may want to develop apps or something that would help the city provide services more efficiently. He stated more and more governments around the country are moving to open data policies. Chair Stanton said that maybe the Regional Council could vote on the creation of an open data policy for MAG data.

Mr. Smith said he believes MAG already has an open data policy with the Arizona Public Records Law. He stated if MAG has the data, it is turned over if it is requested. Chair Stanton said there is an important distinction between an open data policy and following state law as it relates to public records. He explained that open data means that as you collect information you publicly disseminate it, or present the data in ways that the public has easy access to without having to go through a public records request. Chair Stanton said that governments that develop an open data policy and mindset try to provide the public with as much information collected that would normally be only available to bureaucrats, and make it available to its citizens. Mr. Smith said that MAG is developing multiple viewers, and making information available on the MAG website.

Mayor Lane said when you are talking about private businesses and their movements in business retention, some of the information is in a different realm than some of the typical data that MAG assembles and has analytics on. He stated he got the sense that it is seen that MAG can provide the information administratively and not have to go through the Regional Council.

Mr. Smith said the Greater Phoenix Chamber's regional business retention and expansion effort is voluntary for the cities, and they should know that information they give MAG would be publicly available. He stated MAG is really interested in workforce information and what

we need to give community colleges and JTEDS about the future of the workforce. Mr. Smith said if this gets to be an issue in the future, it could be taken to the Regional Council for a vote.

There were no further comments from the committee.

6.   Request for Future Agenda Items

Chair Stanton asked if there were any requests for future agenda items. There were none.

7.   Comments from the Committee

Chair Stanton asked if there were any comments from the committee. Mr. Smith announced that MAG Regional Program Manager Denise McClafferty was not at the meeting due to the death of her mother-in-law.

Adjournment

There being no further business, the Executive Committee adjourned at 12:45 p.m.

_____
                                                  Chair

_____
               Secretary